

Parliamentary Research Digest

INSIDE THIS

VOLUME 5, ISSUE 01

JANUARY, 2018

ISSUE:

OPINION

Accelerating the
Achievement of
Sustainable
Development Goal 01
Page 01

ANALYSIS

Environmental
Analysis of
Pakistan's Coastline
Page 05

PARLIAMENTARY

BUSINESS

Annual Reports of
Senate and
National Assembly
2016-17
Page 09

ANALYSIS

Growing Indo-Israel
Cooperation
Page 13

OPINION

Visualizing
Strategic Vision to
Counter
Asymmetric
Warfare
Page 19

Editorial Board

Editor:

Muhammad
Rashid Mafzool Zaka

Sub Editor:

Ms. Tehseen
Khalid

Members:

Ms. Fakiha Mehmood
Mr. Rizwan Manzoor

Editorial

The dawn of 2018 reiterates Pakistan's national resolve viz a viz our founding fathers vision to set up a parliamentary federal democracy, which focuses in the words of poet philosopher Allama Dr Muhammad Iqbal, on "spiritual democracy," aimed at ensuring in words of Quaid e Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah the protection of life and property as well as well-being of masses especially the poor, as the top priority of the State. The year is welcomed as commencement of Constitutional and Parliamentary milestones in the shape of Senate Elections scheduled for first quarter followed by General Elections and Presidential Election later to complete second consecutive transition from one elected government to another.

The year 2018 is also momentous year for the entire Team of the Pakistan Institute for Parliamentary Services (PIPS), as the Institution completes its decade of establishment since passing of PIPS Act in Dec., 2008. By the grace of Almighty, PIPS is recognized nationally and internationally as exclusive facility offering legislative, research and capacity building services for National Parliament and all four provincial assemblies.

The January issue discusses two themes i.e international relations and sustainable development. It includes relevant and current topics for MPs and decision makers, such as Israel-India Cooperation, Asymmetrical warfare, Environmental analysis of Pakistan's coastline and accelerating the endeavour of SDG-1. Summary of annual report of key business in the Senate and the National Assembly of Pakistan during 2017 has also be highlighted in addition to sharing excerpts of recently published country report by Human Rights Watch, an international watch-dog.

For any specific areas of importance that you want PIPS to send your research or briefing papers, contact us at research@pips.gov.pk.

Muhammad Rashid Mafzool Zaka
Director (Research and I.T)



Group photo of PIPS Session on Constitution and Working of Parliament with 85 member delegation of Sindh Madressatul Islam University on January 19, 2018

Human Rights Conditions in Pakistan

Highlights form Human Rights Report 2018 by Human Rights Watch

Compiled By
Muhammad Rizwan Manzoor,
Research Officer, Economy Desk, PIPS

General Condition:

- Pakistan witnessed fewer attacks by Islamist militants than in previous years; scores of people were killed in attacks primarily targeting law enforcement officials and religious minorities.
- Women, religious minorities, and transgender people faced violent attacks, discrimination, and government persecution, with positive developments such as inclusion of the transgender population in the 2017 census and the first-ever proposed transgender laws were positive developments.
- Afghan refugees in Pakistan continued to face pressure from government authorities to return, although the number of repatriations decreased significantly from 2016.

Freedom of Expression and Attacks on Civil Society

- Journalists and media outlets faced troubles and threats by militants groups and some also blamed security agencies in this regard. The Taliban and other armed groups threatened media outlets and attacked journalists and activists because of their work.
- In January, security forces abducted five men for vocal critics of militant religious groups and Pakistan's security establishment. Four were released after three weeks however, one remained forcibly disappeared at time of writing.
- In May, the Federal Investigation Agency's (FIA) arrested six people for making "blasphemous" comments on the internet, and the interior minister announced new rules that can severely restrict online anonymity. The FIA interrogated at least 40 people for making comments criticizing the military on the internet, and seized their computers and phones for forensic evaluation.
- Human Rights Watch received several credible reports of intimidation, harassment, and surveillance of various NGOs by government authorities. The government used the "Regulation of INGOs in Pakistan" policy to impede the registration and functioning under the agenda of international humanitarian and human rights groups.

Freedom of Religion and Belief

- In 2017, Pakistan witnessed an increase in blasphemy-related violence while the government continued to encourage discriminatory prosecutions and other forms of discrimination against vulnerable groups by failing to repeal discriminatory laws and using religious rhetoric.
- In March, the interior minister described blasphemers as "enemies of humanity," and stated he would take the issue to its "logical conclusion" in taking action against them.
- In April, Mashal Khan, a 23-year-old student at a university in Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province was murdered by a mob over accusations of blasphemous remarks against Islamic injunctions.
- The Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA) sent out a mass text message in May to millions of users informing them that uploading and sharing blasphemous content is a punishable offense, and asking them to report such content.
- In June, an counterterrorism court in Punjab province sentenced a person to death for committing blasphemy on Facebook.
- Religious and sectarian militancy incidents were witnessed. In February, a suicide attack on the shrine of Lal Shahbaz Qalandar in Sehwan, Sindh, claimed by the extremist group Islamic State (also known as ISIS), killed at least 88 people and injured hundreds.
- In a positive development, parliament in March passed the Hindu Marriage Act, the country's first ever federal law recognizing and regulating marriages of the members of the minority Hindu community by allowing Hindu marriages to be registered.

OPINION

Accelerating the Achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 01 in Pakistan

Muhammad Salman

Assistant Director (Research), Senate of Pakistan

Abstract

This study examines the Pakistan's poverty eradication policy in the context of SDG Goal 1. Pakistan has remained successful in reducing the rate of poverty during the periods of high economic growth but without eradicating it. This situation exists due to under-development of human resource to sustain growth momentum. As the poverty eradication policies have been formulated on the backdrop of reducing poverty uni-dimensionally (income based) without taking into account the multi-dimensional nature of poverty (opportunity based). Therefore, to accelerate the achievement of SDG Goal 1— End poverty in all its forms everywhere, government should formulate economic policies that holistically address poverty in all of its dimensions.

1. Introduction and Background:

Over the years Pakistan has been fighting the menace of poverty and economic growth has substantially contributed in its reduction. But growth in Pakistan has staggered due to multiple reasons, perpetuating poverty. Now there is added fear of increase in poverty due to climate change and natural disasters. Pakistan's Human Development Index (HDI) is valued at 0.550 for 2015— placing it at 147 out of 188 countries.¹ According to multidimensional poverty index (MPI), 4 out of ten Pakistan's live in multidimensional poverty and over the past ten years from 2005-2015, the average deprivation share of the poor declined relatively little, from 52.9 %to 50.9%.² This situation raises alarms regarding the poverty reduction policies of the country and requires urgent overhaul of strategies keeping in view the achievement of SDGs.

The SDG Goal 1 – End poverty in all its forms everywhere, calls for renewed commitment towards ending poverty. Unlike the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), not just to reduce the poverty but to eradicate is echoed in the commitment to “leave no one behind”. Poverty has been holistically addressed in this goal as multidimensional and requires actions on multiple fronts. To this end, the SDG Goal 1 provides us an effective means of poverty eradication and aims to ensure social protection for the poor and vulnerable, increase access to basic services and support people harmed by climate-related extreme events and other economic and social shocks.³ Pakistan believes in implementation of SDGs in letter and spirit and Pakistan Parliament has adopted SDGs as National Development agenda on 19 February, 2016. At the policy level, Vision 2025, Pakistan's strategy of sustained and inclusive growth takes into account almost all the SDGs. On the implementation side, SDGs support unit have been established, at Federal and Provincial level in Planning Commission and Planning Departments respectively, to serve as a national coordinators and follow-up entity on SDGs.

In retrospect, Pakistan has remained committed to global agenda of MDGs but due to instability, natural disasters, limited localization and changing institutional arrangements over the last 15 years substantial progress could not be achieved. Pakistan was off track on 24 of 34 indicators which needed an improvement.⁴ However, for SDG Goal 1, Pakistan has an opportunity to holistically address the poverty in Pakistan. The targets can be met with development policy geared towards the eradication of deprivations causing poverty persistently i.e. opportunity based poverty. This will

¹ UNDP.2016. “Briefing note for countries on the 2016 Human Development Report”. Accessed on 10 Nov, 2017. http://hdr.undp.org/sites/all/themes/hdr_theme/country-notes/PAK.pdf

² Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform (Government of Pakistan) in collaboration with Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and UNDP Pakistan, *Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan Report*, 2016.

³ U.N. Economic and Social Council, *Progress towards the SDG: Report of the Secretary-General*. 2017. Accessed on 5th Nov, 2017. http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=E/2017/66&Lang=E

⁴ Planning Commission of Pakistan, *Pakistan Millennium Development Goals Report*, 2013. Accessed on 5th Nov, 2017. <http://www.pk.undp.org/content/dam/pakistan/docs/MDGs/M DG2013Report/f inal%20report.pdf>

enable government for effective budgeting and social security programmes to eradicate poverty. Therefore, measures which accelerate the achievement of SDG Goal 1 are crucial to be identified.

2. Aim of the study:

This paper aims to highlight the issues of poverty in Pakistan in order to eradicate it with reference to accelerate the achievement of SDG Goal 1.

3. Research Question:

Pakistan like many other developing has pursued the poverty eradication by using the uni-dimensional poverty benchmarks. This was a narrowed down approach missing the intensity and deprivation faced in the long run by poor people (in other arenas such as health, education and asset ownership) and consequently missing the linkages of opportunity inequality and poverty. Additionally, these deprivations led to under development of human resource vital for sustainable growth in the long-run. Therefore, by recognizing the multidimensional nature of poverty in formulation of economic policies, Pakistan will be able to unlock its human resources potential and poverty eradication. This paper aims to identify reasons why poverty wasn't reduced substantially by using the uni-dimensional poverty measure (Income based). Moreover, it will attempt to identify gaps in existing poverty reduction policies and to harness the opportunities, till yet not taken into account for tackling the menace of poverty.

4. Overview of Poverty in Pakistan:

In Pakistan, Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform (Planning Commission) calculates the absolute level of poverty in the country using the Household Integrated Economic Survey (HIES) – part of the Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM) provides data on household consumption of several food and non-food items. Pakistan over the year has made great strides in the reduction of poverty but remained subject to controversy and success was mixed due to changing poverty measures.

During 2001, Pakistan adopted the **Food Energy Intake (FEI)** method for measuring poverty headcount ratio. Using consumption data of 1998-99, the official poverty line was estimated at Rs 637.54 per person per month on the basis of minimum energy consumption of 2,350 kcal a day. This poverty line was successively adjusted for inflation, with the official threshold reaching Rs 1,745 per adult equivalent per month by 2010-11. This method raised scepticism, when poverty was assessed at 12.4 % in 2011 falling from 34.4% in 2001; this was judged to be improbable under prevalent socioeconomic conditions in the country at the time.

This followed the Planning Commission adoption of a **Cost of Basic Needs (CBN)** approach in 2016. This takes into account households' average spending on food (on the basis of caloric intake), and then estimates major non-food expenditures for households. The poverty incidence using the new (CBN) methodologies for the period 1998-99 to 2013-14 measured that 29.5 % of the population, or 55 million people, were living below the poverty line as compared to only 9.3 % of the population (or 17 million people) by FEI methodology. The good outcome was that both measures showed reduction in poverty.⁵

Multi-dimensional poverty: To understand the entrenched poverty in Pakistan there was need to measure opportunity based poverty which can include a diverse range of indicators (like Health, literacy, asset ownership, and powerlessness) to reflect its multidimensional nature. Responding to it and demand arising from the commitment to SDGs, the Planning Commission with the help of

⁵ State Bank of Pakistan, *Annual Report: The State Pakistan's Economy*, 2016. Accessed on 15 Nov, 2017. www.sbp.org.pk/reports/annual/arFY16/Chapter-07.pdf

Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI) launched Pakistan's first ever official report on multidimensional poverty index (MPI) on 20 June, 2016. Pakistan National MPI constitutes three dimensions of education, health and standard of living and 15 indicators.⁶ The report reveals Pakistan's multidimensional poverty index (MPI) dropped from 0.292 in FY04/05 to 0.197 in FY14/15, while the headcount ratio fell from 55.2 % to 38.8 %. However, the average deprivation share of the poor declined relatively little, from 52.9 % to 50.9 %. It shows, each poor person is, on average, deprived in almost half of the weighted indicators, and there has been little improvement in this dynamic over the past 10 years. Moreover, poverty in urban areas is 9.3 % as compared to 54.6 % in rural areas.

Nationally the indicators majorly contributing to MPI were years of schooling (29.7 %), access to health facilities (19.8 %) and child school attendance (10.5 %) while at the dimensional level, education was the largest contributor to the MPI (42.8 %), followed by living standards (31.5 %) and health (25.7 %).⁷

5. Policy options for legislators and policy-makers:

According to the provisional results of 6th Population and Housing Census Pakistan has a population of 207.774 million, with an average annual growth rate of 2.4% over a period of 1998-2017.⁸ This increasing population will further increase and intensify poverty; to this end below mentioned are possible policy interventions:

- i. **Multi-Dimensional Poverty Index (MPI):** Pakistan shall simultaneously adopt two national poverty lines. Besides, the Cost of Basic Need Approach (outcome based), multi-dimensional poverty index (opportunity based) shall also be included in policy making to achieve SDG Goal 1. The SDG Goal 1 holistically addresses the poverty in all of its dimensional. Therefore, MPI will accelerate the achievement of targets inscribed in SDG Goal 1 and their monitoring.
- ii. **Focus on Rural Development:** Recent estimates of MPI showed poverty in urban areas is 9.3 % as compared to 54.6 % in rural areas. This is alarming as climate change can further aggravate the poverty and induced internal migrations. Pakistan shall devise a holistic agriculture policy to increase the agriculture production which will act as bulwark against poverty in rural areas of Pakistan.
- iii. **Revise public spending on pro-poor sectors:** Pakistan poverty reduction strategy of Pakistan— outlines expenditure on 17 pro-poor sectors provided in Fiscal Responsibility and Debt Limitation Act (FRDLA) 2005, and that public spending on these sectors as a percentage of GDP should not be less than 4.5%. However, an amendment shall be made to the act for specifically increasing the ratio of public spending on education and health to 5 % of GDP.
- iv. **Enhanced parliamentary oversight:** The government claims that a major boost to safety-net spending since 2007 and to BISP in particular has facilitated the reduction in poverty in recent years.⁹ However, examination of pro-poor expenditure as well as development expenditure in Pakistan shows miss-alignment with the government policies and SDGs. Therefore, Parliaments will have to keep strict checks on the public spending to keep them in-line with government policies and international commitments.¹⁰

⁶ Years of schooling, access to health facilities, child school attendance, cooking fuel, assets, sanitation, land and livestock, educational quality, over-crowding, full immunization, ante-natal care, improved walls, assisted delivery, water, electricity.

⁷ Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform (Government of Pakistan) in collaboration with Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and UNDP Pakistan, *Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan Report*, 2016.

⁸ Federal Bureau of Statistics, "Summary Results of 6th Population Census", 2017. Accessed on 24 Nov, 2017. www.fbs.gov.pk.

⁹ Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan, *PRSP Annual Progress Report FY 2015/16*, 2017. Accessed on 25th Nov, 2017. http://www.finance.gov.pk/poverty/Annual_PRSP_Progress_FY_2015_16.pdf

¹⁰ Faisal Bari, "A flawed Development Model," Dawn, September 23, 2016

6. Conclusion:

This study concludes that the uni-dimensionally (income based) approach towards addressing the poverty in Pakistan fails to address the deep-rooted poverty (multi-dimensional poverty). Poverty in Pakistan persists due to many factors including; health, education, access to justice, assets ownership and sanitation. To accelerate the achievement of SDG Goal 1 this states; “End poverty in all its forms everywhere”, government shall embrace the centrality of MPI in designing poverty eradication policies. Moreover, it is recommended that public spending in education and health sector be increased in line with the achievement of SDG Goal 1.

ANALYSIS**Environmental Analysis of Pakistan's Coastline****Nayab Abeer**

Young Parliamentary Subject Expert, PIPS

Introduction

Pakistan is blessed with almost 1050km long coastline along the Arabian Sea with some of the most important coastal areas including Karachi, Gwadar, Pasni and Omarah. Sea pollution is becoming widespread due to urbanization, rapid industrialization and frequent incidents of oil spills. Large amount of sewage and industrial waste is dumped in the River Indus daily which has decreased the quality of fresh water flow to the Arabian Sea. Significant amount of heavy metals have been traced in marine life.¹ These metals are recognized as carcinogens and mutagens. Sea Pollution greatly compromises the safety and quality of sea foods which not only affects the livelihood but also the health of people. If this pollution is not controlled, it would result in tremendous loss both ecologically and economically.

Coastline of Pakistan

The coastline of Pakistan is nearly 1050 km long. The coast of Pakistan can be divided into coasts of Sindh and Balochistan. Both of these coasts exhibit large variability in climate, hydrological resources and physical limitations. At the Sindh coast Indus River falls to the Arabian Sea and contributes into the large Indus River delta with wide variability of estuaries and mangroves. The Sindh coastal region is located between the Indian borders along Sir Creek on the east to Hub River along the Balochistan coast on the west. Flow to the Indus River is contributed by approximately 300,000 km² of the Indus watershed of which 50% is located outside Pakistan (India, China & Afghanistan). The most prominent ecological feature of the Sindh is the Indus Delta which is of approximately 1600 km² covering 85% of the coastal belt in Sindh. The Indus Delta covers an area of about 0.6 million hectare, with a coastline of 250 km, bordering the city of Karachi in the northwest. The Indus Delta is comprised of 17 major creeks and numerous minor creeks with extensive areas of mudflats, and 0.129 million hectare of mangrove forests.² These dense forests are mostly located in the pockets created by the creeks. The source of fresh water in this region is from the Indus River which flows through the delta before reaching the Arabian Sea.

The Indus delta is the most prominent ecological feature of the Sindh coast with a network of tidal creeks which are formed as a result of changes in river beds and a large number of small islands that support mangrove vegetation. The largest arid climate mangroves in the world are located in Indus Delta. On the basis of coverage, these mangrove forests are the 13th largest mangrove forests in the world. The coast of Karachi is 100 km in length. The region has little to no vegetation cover with the exception of scattered patches of mangroves. The Lyari and Malir Rivers flowing through the Karachi City are non-perennial in nature and drain in the Arabian Sea. They carry substantial quantities of untreated urban sewage and industrial effluents.

Pollution of the marine environment:

Pakistan gains tremendous amount of benefits due to its geostrategic position but increasing coastal development followed by degradation of marine resources are enhancing environmental threats to the country. The coastal zone of Pakistan is rich in living and nonliving resources. One of the most important living resources includes mangrove forests which stretch across the Sindh and Balochistan

¹ The Karachi coastline, THE NEWS. June 12, 2015. Accessed, 18 July. 2017. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/45548-the-karachi-coastline>.

² Majeed, Sidra, Sumia Bint Zaman, Irfan Ali, and Shahid Ahmad. "Situational Analysis of Sindh Coast-Issues and Options." (2010). Accessed, 18 July. 2017. <http://waterinfo.net.pk/sites/default/files/knowledge/Situational%20Analysis%20of%20Sindh%20Coast%20%E2%80%93%20Issues%20and%20Options.pdf>

coast. Pakistan comprises of about 350 different species of commercially important marine fisheries. Various other natural resources are also associated with Pakistan's coastal ecosystem, which provide economic goods and services of having long term strategic value. Tremendous environmental issues prevail in the coastal zone of Pakistan mainly due to poor sanitation, disposal of untreated sewage and domestic waste, discharge of industrial effluents. Such wastes are dumped into the Karachi Sea, via Malir River (Ghizri-Korangi Creek area), Layari River (Manora Channel/Karachi Harbour area) and small waste-drains mainly along Clifton Coast and Korangi Coast. The other coastal areas having industrial-pollution problems are Hub Coast, through Hub Industrial Estate, and Gadani Coast, through industries based in Gadani area. The heavy metals, persistent organic pollutants, air pollution and oil pollution are the more significant factors.³

The mangrove forest and marine life in the area of Karachi is severely affected by increasing pollution level due to intensive activities of trade. Increasing coastal development activities have accelerated the deterioration of coastal environment with depletion of coastal resources, public health risks and loss of biodiversity.

Sea pollution due to industrial waste discharge

Karachi is the industrial and corporate center of Pakistan with 8000 small and large industrial units but the sea water of this region is adversely affected due to the discharge of industrial waste from Korangi, Landhi, and Karachi Export Processing Zone. Three main coastal industries that are mainly responsible for large volumes of effluents are steel mill, power plants and refineries.⁴ Nearly 2,500 industrial units including 170 tanneries dispose untreated waste into the sea, in the Korangi industrial area similarly from Bhains Colony, continuous flow of water with animal dung is another source of pollution. Also, the oil spills from ships and fishing trawlers transiting the port are also contributing towards pollution. It has also been estimated that 3 tons of waste is dumped daily in the sea at the Karachi coast.⁵ The sewage waste generation in Karachi is some more than 300m gal/day, out of which 40% is domestic waste and 60% is industrial waste.⁶ These activities have resulted in disruption of fishing practices and economic activities. Besides depriving the fishermen from their livelihood, the growing pollution levels are also destroying the marine life. Some of the marine life is contaminated with lead, which if consumed by humans through seafood, can lead to anemia, kidney failure, and brain damage. Even the mangrove forests are threatened by this pollution. Unfortunately, this ever worsening situation has failed to draw the attention of both the public as well as private sector on a wide scale.

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea - 10 December 1982

The United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) also called the Law of the Sea Convention or the Law of the Sea treaty is the international agreement that resulted from the third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS III), which took place between 1973 and 1982. The Law of the Sea Convention defines the rights and responsibilities of nations with respect to their use of the world's oceans, establishing guidelines for businesses, the environment,

³ Qureshi, Riffat M. "Contribution of Pakistan in the IAEA/RCA/UNDP regional project on management of marine coastal environment and its pollution." *Science Vision* 7, no. 3-4 (2002): 210-223. Accessed, 27 July. 2017. http://www.sciencevision.org.pk/BackIssues/Vol7/Vol7No34/Vol7No3%264_18_Contributions_of_Pakistan_RiffatQureshi.pdf

⁴ Brief on Environmental Problems of the Marine and Coastal areas, Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency, 2005. http://environment.gov.pk/PRO_PDF/PositionPaper/Marine%20pollution.pdf. Accessed, 18 July. 2017.

⁵ Water Pollution due to Industrial Waste, LEAD Pakistan, <http://www.lead.org.pk/hr/attachments/issues/Water%20Pollution%20due%20to%20Industrial%20Waste.pdf>. Accessed, 16 July. 2017.

⁶ Qureshi, Riffat M. "Contribution of Pakistan in the IAEA/RCA/UNDP regional project on management of marine coastal environment and its pollution." *Science Vision* 7, no. 3-4 (2002): 210-223. Accessed, 27 July. 2017. http://www.sciencevision.org.pk/BackIssues/Vol7/Vol7No34/Vol7No3%264_18_Contributions_of_Pakistan_RiffatQureshi.pdf

and the management of marine natural resources. Pakistan ratified this convention on Feb, 1997⁷ but Pakistan's effort to fulfil the obligations prescribed by this law still remains ambiguous.

Pollution Control by Pakistan Maritime Security Agency (PMSA)

After the catastrophic oil spill in Karachi by the MV Tasman Spirit in 2003, an urgent need was felt for the formulation of a comprehensive anti-pollution plan. Subsequently, a comprehensive National Marine Disaster Contingency Plan (NMDCP) was prepared to deal with all marine disasters, including oil spills, search and rescue, and salvage operations. A comprehensive National Marine Disaster Contingency Plan was proposed to cater for all marine disasters including pollution from Oil, Search and Rescue and Salvage Operations at sea. The National Oil Spill Contingency Plan (NOSCP) was incorporated in this plan. The plan called 'National Marine Disaster Contingency Plan' was approved in 2007.

Measures to Conserve Sea and its resources

- i. **Management of mangroves:** Mangroves are very unique and valuable ecosystems as they support a range of wildlife and fisheries resources and also supply a range of commercial products besides providing a number of ecological services. Few of the services provided by mangrove involve timber and honey production, fisheries nursery values, sewage wastewater treatment, and coastal protection.⁸ Sustainable use and conservation of mangroves can be ensured by encouraging community regulation and management. Development policies must incorporate the factor of community usage and acceptance. Such policies must include community participation at all stages of development of any management policy. Formulation of national mangrove management plan is very crucial which refers to ecological, economic and social needs.
- ii. **Ecotourism:** According to World Conservation Union (IUCN) Ecotourism is the environmentally responsible travel to natural areas, in order to enjoy and appreciate nature (and accompanying cultural features, both past and present) that promotes conservation, have a low visitor impact and provide for beneficially active socio-economic involvement of local peoples. Ecotourism ensures the low-impact of human involvement on nature, appreciation of, local cultures and biodiversity. It Supports the local conservation efforts and provides Sustainable benefits to local communities. Through local participation in decision-making the efforts to conserve nature are maximized. Therefore Ecotourism is very important to conserve Pakistan's Sea and its resources.
- iii. **Control of Industrial/Commercial Pollution:** The release of toxic gases from industrial plants constitutes a serious hazard to human health and the environment. Therefore it is of great importance to exercise control over such emissions. Karachi is the biggest trade and economic center of Pakistan having more than 6,000 small and large industrial units. Pollution problems in this region have arisen mainly from the indiscriminate discharge of effluent from industrial and agricultural sources and disposal of untreated liquid and solid wastes into the coastal environment. So it is of utmost importance that pollution is controlled at source and effluents are treated before their discharge. Environmental Regulations must be implemented and enforced by the government. Industries must modify their production system to ensure that no hazardous substances are used in manufacturing of products or released into the environment as by products. Use of recalcitrant packaging material must be minimized and use of recyclables must be promoted.

⁷ Hussain, Ahmad, and Z. A. Gillani. "Fulfilling environment related international commitments through implementation of multilateral environmental agreements (meas) in pakistan." A scientific journal of COMSATS–Science Vision 18 (2014): 1-2. Accessed, 18 July. 2017. http://www.sciencevision.org.pk/BackIssues/Vol18/02_Vol18_Fulfilling_Environment_AhmadHussain.pdf

⁸ Saenger, Peter. "Sustainable management of mangroves." (1999): 163. Accessed, 27 July. 2017. http://epubs.scu.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1653&context=esm_pubs

- iv. **Sustainable Use of Sea:** Goal 14 of Sustainable Development Goals promotes the conservation and sustainable use of oceans, seas and marine resources. The need for this was felt due to increasingly adverse impacts of climate change, overfishing and marine pollution. As coastal pollution and climate change directly impacts the welfare and livelihoods of people in Pakistan, the need to conserve sea and its resources is of utmost importance. Pakistan has witnessed numerous incidences of large mammals washing up dead on its coastlines and its seas and oceans being over polluted due to human activities. Plastic Marine debris has been recorded as 0.07– 0.19 MMT/year.⁹ And nearly 3 tons of waste is dumped daily in the sea at the Karachi coast. Numerous industries discharge their waste directly into the sea. Government of Pakistan has taken a number of steps to improve the fisheries sector such as Biological and Hydrological Research, Quality Control Services, Renovation of other Landing Sites/Auction Halls, Modernizing the Fishing Fleets but to achieve Goal 14 of the Sustainable Development Goals, Pakistan has to make great effort to ensure renewal of policies related to life under the sea, establishment of framework in line with international conventions, carry out further research and introduce new technologies.
- v. **Installation of Sewage Treatment Plants:** Sewage treatment is the process of removing contaminants from wastewater, primarily from household sewage. It includes physical, chemical, and biological processes to remove these contaminants and produce environmentally safer treated wastewater. A by-product of sewage treatment is usually a semi-solid waste or slurry, called sewage sludge that has to undergo further treatment before being suitable for disposal or land application. Overall the process is very effective in neutralizing liquid waste. There is a dire need for the installation of proper functioning sewage treatment plants near the coastal regions of Pakistan because it has been estimated that almost 3 tons of waste is dumped daily in the sea at the Karachi coast and Nearly 2,500 industrial units including 170 tanneries dispose untreated waste into the sea, in the Korangi industrial area. Many environmental issues prevail in the coastal zone of Pakistan due to poor sanitation, disposal of untreated sewage and discharge of industrial effluents. These factors directly affect the health of people residing in coastal areas. Sea pollution also directly affects the quality of fish making it poisonous and unhealthy for consumption. Therefore to protect human health and conserve sea resources, pollution sources must be controlled.

Conclusion

Many environmental issues prevail in the coastal zone of Pakistan and amongst them the most significant issue is the disposal of domestic wastes and industrial effluent directly into the sea. In addition, the coastal developmental activities have also accelerated the impacts of pollution, leading to the deterioration of quality of coastal environment, depletion of coastal resources, public health risks and loss of bio-diversity. Many initiatives have been taken by the Government of Pakistan for the protection of sea and its resources since the catastrophic oil spill in Karachi by the MV Tasman Spirit in 2003 but the pollution issue still prevails due to lack of sustainable Marine Management. Therefore detailed scientific and socio-economic research, renewed policies and improved techniques are required to maximize productivity and ensure sustainable use of Marine resources.

⁹ Jenna R. Jambeck et. al. 2015. "Plastic waste inputs from land into the ocean." Accessed 27th April 2017.
(https://www.iswa.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Calendar_2011_03_AMERICANA/Science-2015-Jambeck-768-71_2_.pdf)

PARLIAMENTARY BUSINESS**The Senate of Pakistan**
Annual Report for the Parliamentary Year 2016-2017

Samra Minhaj,
Young Parliamentary Subject Expert, PIPS

The Annual Report by Senate of Pakistan encompasses a comprehensive review of business transacted by the Upper House in the Parliamentary year 2016-2017. It includes the annual legislative business, performance of committees, outreach programs along with support services to the House, committees and members. Through 2016-2017, a total of 17 Senate Sessions and 3 Joint Sitzings were held with an average attendance of 67%.

LEGISLATIVE BUSINESS

Legislation is the key function of a Parliament. In this Parliamentary year, 45 Government Bills were transmitted by National Assembly Secretariat to the Senate of Pakistan, all of which were referred to Standing Committees. 29 Bills were reported back by Standing Committees out of which 11 were passed with proposed amendments and 18 Bills were passed with amendments as recommended by the National Assembly. Furthermore, 4 Private Members' Bills were passed by the Senate in the year 2016-2017. The important legislations made regarding issues affecting the public at large include The Un-Attended Orphans (Rehabilitation and Welfare) Bill, 2013; The Prohibition of Corporal Punishment Bill, 2016; The Representation of People (Amendment) Bill, 2016; The Emigration (Amendment) Bill, 2013; The Anti-Rape Laws (Criminal Laws) (Amendment) Bill, 2013 and The Anti-Honor Killing Laws (Criminal Laws Amendment) Bill, 2014.

Parliamentary Questions: Asking questions on every aspect of administrative and government activity during the Question Hour is an inherent parliamentary right of the members. During this Parliamentary year, the Senate received 4527 Starred questions, out of which 3947 were admitted, 235 disallowed, 345 replied, whereas, 1364 were referred to the Standing Committees. The Senate received 23 Unstarred questions out of which 18 were admitted, 05 disallowed, 09 carried forward and 09 were replied to by the minister concerned.

Resolutions: In the year 2016-2017, the Senate received a total of 759 resolutions out of which 648 were admitted, 56 disallowed, 55 lapsed, 01 withdrawn by the member, 56 passed by the House and 01 was rejected by the House. 1 resolution was not pressed by the mover, 14 were dropped by the House, 286 were admitted but lapsed and 290 were carried forward. The themes of these Resolutions varied from socio-economic issues faced by the public to National Security matters. Important resolutions were passed by the Senate regarding Council of Common Interest, infrastructure and development projects, National Safety Plan, National Transport Policy, women representation in Council of Islamic ideology, climate change, and expressing solidarity with the people of Kashmir among several others.

Motions Under Rule 218: During the session 247 – 258, the Senate received 855 Notices of Motion under Rule 218. Out of these 765 were admitted, 45 disallowed, 44 lapsed, and 01 was withdrawn by member. 45 matters were discussed in the House, 11 were dropped, 01 admitted but withdrawn by the member, 338 admitted but lapsed, and 370 were carried forward. Under this parliamentary tool, several matters of national importance were deliberated upon, including overall performance of NAB, financial position of OGDCL, planning of CDA, along with foreign issue motions like the Indian Violation of LOC etc.

Motions under Rule 60: Total 05 Notices of Motion under Rule 60 were received out of which 03 motions were admitted, 03 were discussed, 01 lapsed and 01 was disallowed. Different national issues were discussed in these motions such as National bank loans, flaws in NTS testing service and construction of service stations on M1, etc.

Adjournment Motions: During the Parliamentary year 2016-2017, the Senate Secretariat received notices of 273 adjournment motions out of which 160 were set down in the Orders of the Day, 48 were discussed, 47 dropped, 46 held out of order, 13 withdrawn, 06 held infructuous, and 113 were lapsed. The key areas addressed in these adjournment motions include law and order situation, foreign affairs, governance, defence and trade related issues.

Privilege Motions: During the year, the Senate Secretariat received 17 notices of Privilege Motions out of which 08 were moved, 02 were withdrawn and 07 have not been moved by the concerned members so far.

Calling Attention Notices: The Senate received 522 Calling Attention Notices of which 298 were found in order. 119 of these were set down in Order, 94 made by the Ministers concerned, and 10 were referred to the concerned Standing Committees. These Calling Attention Notices related to issues regarding Pakistan's foreign policy, governance, minorities, water, power and gas, trade, environment, health, education, finance and human rights violation. Some key notices included hunting permits issued to Qatari Princes, child labor, gas issues in Baluchistan, decline in textile exports, non-implementation of early flood warning system, TB control, etc.

COMMITTEES AT WORK

The Senate of Pakistan has an efficient Committee System performing the task of refining legislation and oversight of the executives. A total of 392 Committee meetings were held in the year 2016-2017 and three new Committees were formed i.e. Committee on Delegated Legislation, Special Committee on Marginalized Segments of Society, and Special Committee to explore the possibility and prepare the case of Mr. Abdul Sattar Edhi for Award of Nobel Prize. Rest of the Standing Committees have efficiently held Committee meetings, addressed the business referred by the House, laid reports before the House, and have taken up issues of national and international importance.

Senate Forum for Policy Research: The purpose of SFPR is to assist the Honourable Senators and the Secretariat staff in recommending policy options or solutions regarding issues of public importance. Some of the activities of SFPR during 2016-2017 are stated as follows: Integrated Energy Planning, briefing on Tax Reforms proposals by RAFTAAR (Civil Society Organization), recommendations for the Budget 2016-2017, follow-up on the Media Commission Report-2014, report on the issues of Forest Depletion, and impact of CPEC on Economy of Pakistan.

PARLIAMENTARY OUTREACH

Parliamentary outreach programs play a vital role in strengthening the bilateral relations between countries and their people. The Senate of Pakistan has been actively engaged in promoting constructive Parliamentary relations by exchanging delegations and participating in international events. In order to promote parliamentary diplomacy, Honourable Chairman Senate has introduced a new initiative of signing bilateral MoUs with fellow parliaments of the world. In this regard, the Inter Parliamentary Relations (IPR) Division has made possible the signing of MoUs with the Parliament of Belarus and Kingdom of Cambodia during the parliamentary year 2016-2017. In this year, the IPR Division successfully executed 32 parliamentary delegations to IPU, CPA, APA, UN and Bilateral Parliamentary Fora. Moreover, 54 Parliamentary Friendship Groups were formed during the year and IPR Division arranged their meetings to discuss mutual issues of public concern.

Other outreach activities of the Senate in the year 2016-2017 include the induction of interns in Senate Internship Programs, Senate Public Petitions Table (PPT), events organized on occasions of national importance, and Senate publications.

Gali-e-Dastoor: A corridor in the Parliament House of Pakistan has been designed with murals to pay tribute to the struggles and sacrifices of millions of Pakistanis in order to acquire their

democratic rights in the country. Interested visitors from all over the country can book a tour of the remarkable Dastoor Gali on the official Senate website. More than 50 groups of students and families have visited the historic in the year 2016-2017, which is an effort to bridge the gap between Parliament and the public.

Support to the House, Committees and Members: These services include: Research Support to the Chairman Office and Secretary Senate, to outgoing and incoming parliamentary delegations, fulfillment of exclusive research requests by Senators, and provision of speeches and statements, Domestic Trainings and Inland Courses, Foreign trainings and courses, E-Parliament, Library Services, Technical Support, Bilingual Documents and improved infrastructure.

The National Assembly of Pakistan **Performance Report – 4th Parliamentary Year (2016 –2017)**

In its fourth Parliamentary Year (1st June, 2016 - 31st May 2017), the 14th National Assembly of Pakistan effectively continued its role in legislation, oversight of public offices, parliamentary outreach and diplomacy. The key focus of the House this year has been the outreach strategy of National Assembly in terms of bilateral foreign relations as well as parliamentary openness and transparency to every citizen of Pakistan. Several landmark developments in Parliamentary oversight and public-interest legislation also made it to the headlines in the 4th Parliamentary year, 2016-17.

Legislative Performance

The Assembly remained in the Session for 133 days; spread over 11 Sessions, including 02 Joint Sessions. In these 11 Sessions, a sum of 15 Government Bills were passed by the National Assembly along with 11 Private Members' Bills. 42 Acts of the Parliament and 04 Ordinances were also a part of legislative business of the House in 4th Parliamentary year. Some landmark legislations were made in this year ranging over the a wide range of subjects including human rights, protection of women and children, Hindu marriages, cybercrime, criminal law, military courts and climate change. The National Assembly received 1174 draft Resolutions out of which 40 Resolutions were passed in the House. In the Question Hour of the sittings, 7802 questions were received and 3602 (46%) were admitted by the Assembly. Furthermore, out of 355 Calling Attention Notices, 87 (24.5%) Statements were made in the House. 70 Questions of Privilege were received and 25 (35.7%) were referred to Privileges Committees. Honorable Speaker received 131 adjournment motions in total, out of which only 05 were converted into Motion under Rule 259.

Standing Committees at Work

The National Assembly of Pakistan has a strong Committee system which has empowered the Committees to examine the expenses, administration, delegated legislations, public petitions and policies of ministries and public bodies. In the 3rd Parliamentary year, 31 Ministerial Standing Committees were functioning along with 24 Sub-Committees. Moreover, the Assembly also has 6 Non-Ministerial and 10 Parliamentary Committees. 280 Committee meetings were held in which 86 Bills were referred to. They finalized 57 Committee Reports and 28 Reports were presented in the National Assembly. In the previous year, 26 Reports were submitted, demonstrating a consistent performance of the House over the years.

Public Accounts Committee: On August 1st, 2016 the National Assembly Rules were amended in order to include six Senators in the Public Accounts Committee, which ensured the inclusion and representation of Senate of Pakistan in the oversight of country's financial matters. In the 4th Parliamentary year; PAC held 78 meetings, disposed of 55 complaints received and examined 2765 Paras and Grants.

Parliamentary Committee on National Security: On 21st and 28th March, 2017 respectively, the national Assembly and the Senate adopted a motion to constitute a Parliamentary Committee on

National Security by the Honorable Speaker in consultation with Chairman Senate to discuss matters relating to National Security, implementation on National Action Plan, and the criminal justice system in the country. Consequently, a 33-Member Parliamentary Committee on National Security is formed under Chairmanship of the Speaker National Assembly.

Parliamentary Committee on Electoral Reforms (PCER): PCER was formed by the Speaker National Assembly in consultation with Chairman Senate on 25th July, 2014 comprising 33 Members. After detailed and extensive deliberations on unification of 9 Electoral Laws of Pakistan into one Election Law, PCER presented its Second Interim Report before the two Houses, along with Draft Elections Bill, 2017. On 10th May, 2017, the Sub-Committee for Electoral Reforms has submitted the Electoral Reforms Package, and the Draft Constitution (Amendment) Bill recommended for enactment.

Parliamentary Diplomacy

In 2016-17, the Members of National Assembly robustly participated at various regional and international forums to promote regional cooperation, promoting trade, countering terrorism and strengthening the parliamentary democracy. Some major achievements in terms of Parliamentary diplomacy include the election of Dr. Fehmida Mirza (MNA) as Member of CPA International Executive Committee for 2016-18, and Parliament of Pakistan named as the Secretariat of CPA Asia Region for the years 2016-18. The international conferences arranged by the Parliament include 1st SAARC Young Parliamentarians Conference (August 16-17, 2016); International Parliamentary Seminar on Kashmir (IPSK) Islamabad (January 5-6, 2017); and International Conference on Role of Women Parliamentarians in Strengthening Democracy and Social Justice, Islamabad (March 12-15, 2017).

Parliamentary Forums

Along with Women's Parliamentary Caucus and Young Parliamentarians Forum, another Parliamentary Forum was introduced on February 16th, 2017, named as the **Sustainable Development Goals Secretariat**. The Secretariat is exclusively dedicated towards tracking, monitoring and evaluating the development in social sector and has devised inclusive strategies to assist the Parliamentarians with regard to SDGs related legislation, government policies and oversight.

Institutional Reforms

In order to strengthen and modernize the Pakistan's Parliamentary system, the 14th National Assembly has taken steps to bring about various institutional reforms in National Assembly Secretariat. The key developments in terms of institutional reforms in 2016-17 include initiatives such as Inauguration of Democracy Monument at Parliament House, expansion of Legislative Drafting Council, digitization of Debates and Acts of the Parliament, Inauguration of Parliamentary Studies Program and Training of Trainers, launch of Internship program by Project Management Unit of National Assembly and establishment of Infant Day Care Center at the Secretariat.

ANALYSIS

Growing Indo-Israel Cooperation**Fakiha Mahmood**

Research Officer, PIPS International Relations Desk

The year 2017 ended with the stir caused by the US announcement to shift its embassy in Israel to Jerusalem, and 2018 began with six days trip of Israeli Prime Minister Mr. Netanyahu to India with a package full of deals, first of its kind in the past 15 years. India was among those countries which voted against the shifting of US embassy to Jerusalem in the United Nations General Assembly. With its horrendous track record of human rights violations in occupied Kashmir, India's policy towards Palestine-Israel conflict retains the key to understanding India's place in the world. Striking a thin balance between its relations with the Muslim states on one hand and Israel on the other hand has remained a challenge for policy makers in New Delhi since independence. However, the recent trends are now indicating an overt tilt of this balance toward Israel.

Nuclear armed Israel and India share the burden of being one of the major parties in the oldest disputes, i.e. Palestine and Kashmir, lingering on since the end of the World War II and the establishment of the United Nations. Both countries are faced with the challenge to suppress the defenseless civilian population whose territory they occupy. With ever increasing defense expenditures both countries continue to threaten the regional as well as global peace and security. Hence, it is imperative to gain insight into India-Israel bilateral relationship in the current context.

Historical Background

India voted against the resolution 181 of 1947 of the United Nations which partitioned Palestine into two separate states. Against the partition plan Nehru supported the idea of a federal state providing autonomy to areas inhabited by either Jews or Muslims. In principle the Indian leadership supported the Muslim stance on the question of Palestine. They did not agree to the Zionist cause which saw in Palestine "land without people for a people without land"¹, as the land of Palestine was inhabited by millions of Muslim.

Furthermore, the potential backlash from the Muslim community of India who had already succeeded in establishing a separate homeland for themselves in Pakistan, was also a reason for the Indian leadership to support the Muslim cause in Palestine-Israel issue. India began its international career as a staunch supporter of the Non-Aligned Movement (NAM). Since independence India has maintained close ties with several Arab states, notably Egypt's Gamal Abdul Nasser which was among the champions of NAM. Over the years a significant portion of Indian diaspora has settled in several Middle Eastern states. In strategic terms, building close ties with the Muslim world was necessary for India in order to crush Pakistan's call of support to save their Muslim Kashmiri brethren subjected to Indian illegal occupation and suppression. Hence even after the end of the cold war, the relationship with the Muslim countries has always factored in while calculating its strategic relationship with Israel.

At the United Nations, India capitalized on the idea of breaking away from the curse of imperialism and colonialism of the western powers. At the same time policy makers in Delhi were conscious of the aspirations of the western powers that they could not ignore on the grounds of realpolitik. Hence, even at the time of the writing of this paper the official stance of India on the question of Palestine is "an early realization of a sovereign, independent, united and viable Palestine co-existing peacefully with Israel."² However, the on ground policy of India towards Israel is much different as

¹ Chinmaya R. Gharekhan, "India-Israel: Retrospective and Prospective," *Strategic Analysis* 41, no. 4 (2017), <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2017.1330443>, (accessed January 16, 2018) 314-324.

² Permanent Mission of India to the United Nations, Statement of the Indian Deputy Permanent Representative at the United Nations General Assembly on the Question of Palestine, 29 November 2017, <https://pminewyork.org/statementgeneral?id=eyJpdil6lkFOXc9RMWFWVGdUUmk3N3VzMfJGSXBRPT0iLCJ2YWx1ZSI6IkM0MEU0TE0wVVD>

both countries cooperate in a wide range of sectors. India recognized the state of Israel in 1950 after the dust of Arab-Israeli war was settled, however, formal relations with Israel were established in 1992. The end of the cold war ushered in a new era in the international politics which provided an opportunity to Indian policy makers to begin formal diplomatic relations with Israel. But from 1950 to 1992, high level visits and exchange of experts continued, also an Israeli consulate continued to work in India during this time period. With the establishment of formal relations, the scope and depth of bilateral cooperation has deepened with each passing day.

India also enjoys cordial bilateral ties with the Palestinian leadership and invests in some development projects as well. India has been financing the construction of Parliament building of future state of Palestine.³ India is also critical of Palestinian support to anti-India resolutions in the OIC put forth by Pakistan. India's policy towards Palestine has remained open ended keeping in view its interests based on the response of the Muslim world with which India has significant trade ties.

Israel's Grassroots Engagement in India

A remarkable feature of India-Israel bilateral relationship is cooperation of Israel with Indian States. Since the establishment of formal diplomatic relations between both the countries a number of dignitaries and officials from various Unions and State governments have visited Israel and signed MoUs in several arenas and working to collaborate accordingly. Some of the areas of cooperation include agriculture, floriculture, horticulture, farming techniques, water management, water harvesting, dairy, rural health, sanitation and skill development. This bilateral cooperation at the State level has been facilitated by the government at the federal level and engaged leaders from different parties including BJP, Congress, Trinamool Congress, All India Anna Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam (AIADMK), Janata Dal (Secular), Biju Janata Dal, Samajwadi Party, and Akali Dal. The States of Gujrat, Haryana, Rajasthan and Punjab are at the forefront of this bilateral cooperation at the grassroots level.⁴

The Center for International Cooperation of Israel's Ministry of Foreign Affairs MASHAV and Center for International Agricultural Development Cooperation of Israel's Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development jointly operationalized a three years' 2012-2015 work plan for agricultural development in India. Under this work-plan Israel committed to establish 26 Centers of Excellence in 9 States.

1. Maharashtra – Centers of Excellence for Mango
2. Akola – Center of Excellence for Citrus
3. Rahuri – Center of Excellence for Pomegranate
4. Karnal, Haryana – Center of Excellence for vegetables
5. Sirsa, Punjab – Center of Excellence for fruits⁵

The third phase of agricultural work plan 2015-18 was given final shape in September, 2015. This work plan will expand cooperation to 6 more States. Similarly, Israeli companies have built desalination plants in Nemeli, Tamilnadu, and Chennai. Greater Mumbai and West Bengal are partnering with Israel's national water company Mekorot. Another group called Tahal has signed deal worth US\$74 million to establish water supply system to 131 villages in the State of Karnataka. In 2013, the Karnataka State Council for Science and Technology also signed MoU with Israeli Industry Centre for Research & Development for assistance and funding in industrial R&D.⁶

Notably, Israel's engagement beyond the capital city surpasses the operations of all other diplomatic missions working in India. US and Germany are among those with largest budgets being spent there,

A1ZUFpeUp6ZTRRQmc9PSIsIm1hYyI6IjhlMDU2ZDBmZDdiZDQ2NWU4NmYyNTQ2YzI1MjIwZWZjNDZlYzg3NmVmYmQONGYzYzI1OTE4OGVmMWY3NzcwNjEifQ==, (accessed January 16, 2018).

³ Chinmaya R. Gharekhan, op. cit., 321-22.

⁴ P. R. Kumaraswamy, "Redefining 'Strategic' Cooperation," *Strategic Analysis* 41, no. 4 (2017) <http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rsan20>, (accessed January 17, 2018), 363-365.

⁵ Embassy of India in Israel, "India Israel Economic and Commercial Relations" <http://www.indembassy.co.il/pages.php?id=14#.WmGc3KiWbIU>, (accessed January 19, 2018).

⁶ Ibid.

but even their penetration deep inside the Indian states is limited as compared to Israel which has been actively expanding its tentacles at the grassroots level in India. This is how, India has not only been circumventing the high politics and the negativities associated with the Israel-Palestine conflict, rather it has been pursued as a well thought out strategy to change the general public's opinion in favor of Israel in order to bring changes in the stated policy at the Federal level in the long run.⁷

Bilateral Trade

Trade between India and Israel has reached \$US 4.16 billion (exclusive of defense) in 2016, as compared to \$US 200 million 1992. The balance of trade favors Israel with exporting goods worth \$US 2.4 billion and India exporting merchandise worth \$US 1.76 billion. The share of India was 3.3% in total Israel's trade. The products between both the countries mainly comprise of pearls, precious stones, chemical and mineral products, machinery, electrical equipment, textile related items, plastic, rubber, plants and vegetables, minerals, base metals, and transport equipment. With 54% of its share, diamond remains significant in bilateral trade. Trade in electronic machinery, high tech products, communication systems and medical equipment is on the rise in recent years.⁸ However, trade in defense realm is the hallmark of bilateral relationship.

Indo-Israel Defense Cooperation

The SIPRI Yearbook 2017 puts India at the top among the list of countries with 33 percent of global share of major weapons import. India is actively working on the agenda of modernization of its weapons over the years. The strategic partnership with US beginning with 2000 has enabled India to move away from its Soviet era dominated weaponry to more sophisticated arms and ammunitions acquired from the western countries. Israel is among the top ten exporters of major weapons in the world according to SIPRI Yearbook 2017. Appearance of Israel among the world's top ten major weapons export countries is remarkable given its small size in terms of territory and population. Nevertheless, Israel capitalizes across the world due to the expertise it has developed in producing sophisticated arms especially radars and sensors as well as in security intelligence up to the level that many countries have put their grudges aside in order to benefit from the Israeli arms and intelligence despite of being critical of its policies towards Palestinians.⁹ Yet, Indo-Israel cooperation in the defense realm is understandable for the circumstances both countries share in terms of the need to suppress civilian population whose territory they illegally occupy.

**Table: World's top ten exporters and importers of major weapons
2012-2016**

<i>Exporters</i>	<i>Global Share (%)</i>	<i>Importers</i>	<i>Global Share (%)</i>
1 USA	33	1 India	13
2 Russia	23	2 Saudi Arabia	8.2
3 China	6.2	3 UAE	4.6
4 France	6.0	4 China	4.5
5 Germany	5.6	5 Algeria	3.7
6 UK	4.6	6 Turkey	3.3
7 Spain	2.8	7 Australia	3.3
8 Italy	2.7	8 Iraq	3.2
9 Ukraine	2.6	9 Pakistan	3.2
10 Israel	2.3	10 Vietnam	3.0

Reference: SIPRI Yearbook 2017

During 1965 and 1971 wars India incredibly benefitted from arms and ammunitions provided by Israel when Pakistan felt betrayed from isolation and arms embargo it faced from its allies in the

⁷ P. R. Kumaraswamy, op. cit., 363-365.

⁸ Embassy of India in Israel, op. cit.

⁹ Ibid.

western world. The deterrence caused by the Lockheed P-3 Orion maritime surveillance aircraft and Harpoon sea-skimming anti-ship missiles obtained from the United States was effectively countered by India through the provision of Barak-I vertically launched Surface-to-Air Missiles (SAMs) to India in 1997.¹⁰ The nuclear tests by India and Pakistan in 1998 were condemned by entire international community, and consequently sanctions were imposed which included arms embargo. Israel did not condemn the Indian nuclear tests, few days after the nuclear tests, a delegation from Israeli Aerospace Industries visited India with the mandate to sale Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (UAVs). Also the sale of advanced electronic equipment for warplanes was ensured in those days under a defense pact.¹¹

Moreover, during the Kargil conflict of 1999, Israel provided India 155mm guns. Soon after, from 2002 to 2005, both countries signed the contract worth \$2.76 billion. Under this deal India received three Phalcon Airborne Warning and Control Systems (AWCSs).¹² The sale of Phalcon system to India was significant because under the technology transfer regime Israel could not sell it to a third country without prior US approval. A similar deal was canceled with China under US pressure in 2000 despite of loss of billions of dollars. But with support from Jewish lobby in US, India did manage to clear the sale of Phalcon system.¹³ India procured four additional AWCSs again in 2011.¹⁴ Table below provides the number and worth of defense related contracts signed from 2013 to 2016 between India and Israel in comparison with USA, Russia and France.

Table: Defense Contracts signed by India during 2013-2016, worth Rs. in Crores						
	2013-14		2014-15		2015-16	
Russia	2	1,341.72	7	6,084.72	3	947.19
Israel	5	3,751.00	1	875.49	4	2,979.26
US	7	6,787.02	2	57.64	4	22,049.97
France	2	298.96	3	1,537.05	0	0.00
Others	6	1,072.15	5	2,706.82	6	3,195.33
Total	21	13,250.85	18	11,261.72	17	29,171.75
Indian Vendors	21	10,676.36	29	53,597.80	44	18,705.54
Grand Total	42	23,927.21	47	64,859.52	61	47,877.29
Reference: Amit Cowshish, "India-Israel Defence Trade: Issues and Challenges," <i>Strategic Analysis</i> 41, no. 4 (2017) https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2017.1330445, (accessed January 16, 2018) 403.						

With the coming in power of BJP led government of Narendra Modi, the pace of India-Israel relations especially in the defense arena has accelerated considerably. High level visits including those of Head of State and the Head of Government have taken place on both sides. Prime Minister Narendra Modi was the first India Head of Government to visit Israel. A number of significant defense deals have been signed and some earlier pending have been finalized, which culminated into the broadening of the spectrum of India's military capabilities. The visit of PM Netanyahu in January 2018, ushered in a new era of bilateral cooperation particularly in defense realm. The timeline below provides an overview of the defense cooperation between India and Israel since 2014 under the Government of Narendra Modi.

Defense cooperation since 2014 under the Government of Narendra Modi¹⁵	
July 2014	Intelligence sharing agreement signed to counter "radical Islamic extremism"

¹⁰ Amit Cowshish, "India-Israel Defence Trade: Issues and Challenges," *Strategic Analysis* 41, no. 4 (2017) <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2017.1330445>, (accessed January 16, 2017) 401-412.

¹¹ Nicolas Blarel, "Assessing US Influence over India-Israel Relations: A Difficult Equation to Balance," *Strategic Analysis* 41, no. 4 (2017) <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2017.1330437>, (accessed January 16, 2018) 395.

¹² Amit Cowshish, op. cit.

¹³ Nicolas Blarel, op. cit.

¹⁴ India-Israel Relations, <http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/history-and-overview-of-india-israel-relations>, (accessed January 15, 2018).

¹⁵ India-Israel Relations, <http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/history-and-overview-of-india-israel-relations>, (accessed January 15, 2018).

	in the region.
November 2014	Barak 8 air and naval defense missile system, jointly developed by India and Israel, was tested successfully.
2015	Around 16 Israeli manufactured unmanned drones ordered.
September 11, 2015	Purchase of 10 armored heron TP drone vehicles worth \$400 million.
December 30, 2015	Barak 8 long-range surface-to-air missile, developed jointly by India and Israel, tested successfully. Tested again on September 20, 2016 on a separate facility.
March 30, 2016	Cooperative agreement worth \$10 billion signed between India firm Reliance Defense and Israeli firm Rafael Advanced Defense Systems. To be carried out in the Indian state of Madhya Pradesh the project will enable the production of air-to-air missile, missile defense systems and surveillance balloons.
February 2017	Launch of Israeli-developed Integrated Under Water Harbour Defense and Surveillance System (IUHDSS)
March 2017	Finalization of purchase of 8,356 Spike Anti-Tank Guided Missiles (ATGMs) and 321 missile launchers produced by Israeli Rafael Advanced Defense Systems Ltd. The deal worth \$1 billion was originally reached in October 2014.
April 2017	Deal signed with India for the procurement of advanced air defense system worth \$2 billion.
May 11, 2017	Israeli manufactured Surface-to-air Python and Derby missile system (SPYDER) successfully tested.
August 2017	Deployment of Israeli supported Comprehensive Integrated Border Management System (CIBMS) along Pakistan's border

The US in Indo-Israel Relations

Since the proclamation of independence by Israel in 1948, the US factor has remained 'constant albeit neither consistent nor direct' in Indo-Israel relationship. The influence of US owes less to the US Administration and relates more to transnational networks and influential personalities working for the Zionist cause. The part played by the associations like Anti-Defamation League (ADL), American Jewish Council (AJC) and the American-Israel Political Action Committee is noteworthy. The US-India Political Action Committee has not only imitated the AIPAC, it has strong links with its members which ultimately gets translated into molding the decision making at top level in the US Administration. While India denounced the proclamation of independence by Israel and voted against the partition plan in the United Nations, India continued dialogue with Israel primarily through the American Jewish lobby. The communication between American Jewish communities with the leaders of Indian National Congress dates as far back as 1920s and 1930s.¹⁶

US Congressmen like Emmanuel Celler in 1940s and Stephen Solarz in 1980 played instrumental role in building ties with the Indian leadership and Indian representatives in the United States and shaped the course of policy at the highest level without even being part of the executive branch or the foreign policy bureaucracy. With support from Nehru's sister Vijaya Lakshmi, India's representative to the UN, Emmanuel Celler was instrumental in ensuring participation of Jewish delegation in the Conference of the Asian Relations Organizations held in March-April 1947 in Delhi. Initially invitations were sent to 32 delegations including Palestinians.¹⁷

The US role in Indo-Israeli ties has changed over the years depending upon varying factors. Initially the US condemned India for its stated anti-Israel policy. On the other hand US has resisted the sale of weapons to India which involved technology transfer. A host of sensitive military hardware and systems are jointly produced by US and Israel. Over the decades, India has mainly procured Israeli manufactured arms and ammunitions because it was difficult to get US-Israel jointly produced

¹⁶ Nicolas Blarel, op. cit., 384-400.

¹⁷ Ibid.

systems and technology due to the stringent technology transfer regime being carried out by the US and more importantly, due to arms embargoes and sanctions put in place in the aftermath of Indian nuclear tests.¹⁸ However, since the beginning of Indo-US strategic partnership in 2000, gradually India has begun avoiding sanctions and embargoes considerably. In the current scenario while the Indo-Israel defense ties are flourishing at a faster pace, the US defense industry seems in a difficult position to find its place in the Indian market. The close cooperation between Indian and Jewish lobby in the US has turned out to be lethal for the US itself perhaps.

The recent announcement of Trump Administration to shift its embassy in Jerusalem has initiated a fresh round of hostilities in the Palestine-Israel conflict. Though India supported the UN General Assembly resolution denouncing the act, but the growing Indo-Israeli ties are clearly pointing towards the tilt of Indian balance in the conflict towards Israel. And the perception that India's diplomatic support to Palestinians has declined is gaining ground. Since the development of formal relations between India and Israel, the support India used to provide to Palestinians through resolutions put forward in the UN General Assembly from time to time is reducing. More recently, India abstained from the resolution in the UN Human Rights Council condemning Israel's air strikes in Gaza in 2014.¹⁹

Conclusion

India has come a long way from the initial opposition of the independence of Israel to a deepening bilateral relationship. Indo-Israel bilateral relationship has witnessed significant strides after the development of formal relations in 1992. With the gradual pacifism of Arab and Muslim world towards the Palestine issue over the decades, Indian policy makers find it easy to reap the opportunities vested in their partnership with the Jewish lobbyists working closely with Indians in the US.

India has opened its doors for Israel deep inside the country for grassroots engagement. Both countries are now moving forward from the initial diamond trade to include multitude of products in bilateral trade. However, defense cooperation remains the hallmark of Indo-Israel relations. As the Indian leadership turns towards a more pronounced policy towards Israel, marking a gradual shift from the earlier clandestine contacts, Israel is reaping the opportunity to gain stronger foothold in the perceived emerging power of the world. Indian obsession with security has made it the world's largest importer of major weapons, and Israel is a key partner in Indian endeavor to overcome its security paranoia. India has already gained significant space in the strategic calculations of the US policy makers, presenting itself a counter weight to China. But the resultant Indo-US strategic partnership has far reaching consequences, going much beyond China.

¹⁸ Debjani Ghosal, "Strategic Hyphenation between India and Israel: The Major Areas of Cooperation and Constraints in the Post-Cold War Era," *Jadavpur Journal of International Relations* 20, no.1 (2016), <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0973598416657971>, (accessed January 19, 2018)

¹⁹ Chinmaya R. Gharekhan, op. cit., 322.

OPINION

Visualizing Strategic Vision to Counter Asymmetric Warfare**Gul Ahsan Rasheed Cheema,**

Law Officer,

Provincial Assembly of Punjab

1. Introduction

“Whosoever, desires constant achievement must modify his behavior pattern with times.”

(Nicholo Machiavelli: The Prince)

Nontraditional security threats are being faced by the whole world. These threats include climate and environmental challenge, extremism, sectarianism, water scarcity, agriculture failure and asymmetric warfare. Today's world depicts an ambiguous picture with sovereignties, directionless groups and masses pursuing for their complex objectives. Transnational clubs, nationless groups and ‘fourth generation warriors’¹ based on religion; self-assumed ideologies, tarnished cultures and illegal financial activities have dragged the world into prevailing anarchy.

Since the beginning of 21st Century, asymmetric warfare has dominated the whole world. It means disparity and no basis of comparison in respect to equality and capability of two forces in clash. To some extent all the conflicts are asymmetric and the clever warrior has always benefited from this quality. Generally this type of war is carried out by non-state actors for their particular interests². Asymmetric warriors use limited sudden attacks against regular armed forces to take advantage of their critical vulnerabilities through treachery to snub the superior technology and strategic preparation of their enemies. Pakistan has been facing this dilemma continuously after 9/11 attacks.

Defining the Term - Asymmetric warfare means “*attempt to undermine opposite armies’ strong areas to exploit their weakness by using methods that are significantly different from usual mode of operations of the opponent*”³. According to CIA “it is the use of new technologies, techniques and strategic methods by a weaker side including state or non-state actors to target the vulnerability of stronger and superior opponents. This also includes selective use of techniques, weapons, diplomatic and nonmilitary channels by non-state actors to snub and constrain operations of stronger force by use of superior methods⁴.

Asymmetric warfare is irregular and unconventional warfare. It is a war in which non-state actors used unconventional techniques against regular state on Armies critically state’s vulnerability to achieve objectives and undermine the states authority to accomplish its strategic vision.⁵ Terrorism and guerrilla war come under the umbrella of Asymmetric warfare and facilitates in advance study of the dilemma of terrorism, which has engulfed the world since 9/11. It is a war among unequal. Even the theory of one man’s terrorist is another man freedom fighter is not applicable to the terrorist groups who destroy and bomb the unarmed and innocent civilians even through suicidal attacks to achieve their political motives⁶. Asymmetric warfare and terrorism are used interchangeably. Terrorism includes tactics used by the fragile against the stronger side or regular army. In this warfare the terrorists play a double game. They not only threaten the masses to pressurize the governments in order to achieve their secret motives but also gain sympathy from various factions of society.

¹ Lind, William S., Maj. John F. Schmitt, and Col. Gary I. Wilson. “Fourth-Generation Warfare: Another Look,” Marine Corps Gazette, December 1994

² Ajey Lele, asymmetric warfare: a state vs non-state conflict; OASIS, N° 20, Julio-December 2014, pp.99

³ Brown, Michael T.: Asymmetric Warfare Paradigm in the 21st Century. Carlisle Barracks, PA: U.A Army war college, 1997.

⁴ Franklin B. Miles DOD Civilian, U.S. Army war college, Pennsylvania; Asymmetric Warfare: An Historical Perspective, (P-3).

⁵ Ajey Lele, op. cit

⁶ Air marshal (Retd) Ayaz Ahmad Khan; Terrorism and Asymmetric Warfare International and Regional implications, <http://www.defencejournal.com>.

2. Threat posed by asymmetric warriors

The warriors used tactics such as pre-emptive attacks, massacres, assassination of government officials, political leaders and state figures; and destructions of state owned entities and infrastructure to create anarchy. The players of asymmetric war play with psyche of masses to change the very concept of National Policy. They change the legality of war and international pressure to conflict resolution by using efficient methods⁷. In the second decade of 21st Century, terrorists have multiplied horror among civilians as well as military strata by using deadly tactics. Even they are using cyber attacks to disrupt economic, political, intelligence and technological procedures of the states⁸.

The main goal of asymmetric warriors is to raise level of cost and magnitude of risk to restrain the stronger side to operate militarily or force it to disengage due to untenable financial and political losses. They also pursue their agenda to press the opponents to bring major changes in their domestic and foreign policies..

The illegitimate military dictatorships and their policy to appease foreign agenda to trigger war in Afghanistan played a major role to breed the gun culture that triggered warfare against Pakistan. It has disrupted not only internal law and order situation in the country but also external outlook of the state⁹. Asymmetric warriors generally use difficult terrain that restricts the mobilization of regular armies such as mountains, jungles and woody areas. In urban areas they also use narrow streets, easy escape points and natural defence positions to dodge the law enforcement agencies. The participants of fourth generation warfare in the region are intranational and transnational groups which are based on religious, cultural, lingual, ideological and illegal financial activities are trying their best to push the country into anarchy.

3. Formulation of strategic vision to counter terrorism

Strategic vision is the combined effort of the government to visualize long term goals after an inclusive consultative process among civil, military and corporate sector leadership. It not only defines but also translates trends, which impact our daily life individually, collectively and institutionally. The main purpose of all this is to integrate between efforts and goals to achieve the desired results. It sets direction for formulation and implementation of strategy; and enables strategical methods proactive, instead of reactive for future challenges.¹⁰ In Pakistan, the Defence Committee of Cabinet chaired by the Prime Minister of Pakistan is engaged in evolving country's strategic vision that is occasionally subject to guidance and scrutiny of the Parliament.

4. Potential Way Forward: Though there has been marked decrease in terrorist attacks in Pakistan since 2013 yet asymmetric warfare has caused heavy loss physically, economically, politically, socially and culturally to the goodwill of the country. Being country's elected chief executive, the Prime Minister has lead from the front to coordinate and steer the process of consultations with civil-military bureaucracy and respective institutions to come up with a broad based consensus-oriented strategic vision to counter terrorism and asymmetric warfare. It is imperative that all civil-military institutions and intelligence agencies have to provide latest and timely information to the Prime Minister and display unmitigated loyalty to the elected legitimate leadership of the country. Conventional strategies have become obsolete to counter this fourth generation warfare and modern workable methods are need of the hour to defeat the terrorist. Following potential way forwards are identified to help country construct a strategic vision to counter terrorism and asymmetric warfare:

⁷ *ibid*

⁸ Clark L.Staten, Executive Director, Emergency Response & Research Institute, USA: Asymmetric Warfare, the Evolution and Devolution of Terrorism; The Coming Challenge for Emergency and National Security Forces (P-3)

⁹ *ibid*.

¹⁰ Strategic vision A selected biography, U.S Army War College, Curriculum Pamphlet, Academic Year 2001.

- i. **Building a Counter Terrorism Narrative:** Counter narrative building has become essential to challenge the narrative of terrorists. A task force comprising the Council of Islamic Ideology, Council of Common Interest, Higher Education Commission, strategists, analysts and scholars of international relations, social scientists, literary figures and criminology must be assigned the task of counter narrative building in light of sanctity of human life as defined in Holy Quran. War should be only defined and allowed in terms of state activity to be steered by the Prime Minister, not the tool of individuals to use it for their own benefits. Marginalized communities and representatives of non-Muslim community must also be part of consultative process for ownership and consensus on the counter narrative strategy. Only wide range consultation can help us formulate a broad-based indigenous narrative to counter terrorism.
- ii. **Zero Tolerance for Terrorist Groups:** The terrorist groups may be categorized into three types: i.e. core, semi peripheral and peripheral. The State must treat hard core terrorists with iron hand without any discrimination. They are major threat not only to the stability of country but also social peace and justice. Semi peripheral groups; i.e. facilitators or semi militant theocratic groups should be rehabilitated for correction of mindset and behavior towards normal life but their mainstreaming should not mean allowing them entry as political parties. It can be very fatal for country's future. Peripheral i.e. groups of general public who have soft corner for the terrorists should also be sensitized. It is a challenge to fully eradicate sympathy from amongst masses for any asymmetric warriors. No army in the world can win any kind of war without sympathetic support of its own peoples. Re-engineering and re-flourishing of these morbid fear operators must be banned.
- iii. **Respect of Constitutional Framework and Civil-military harmony:** The father of the nation, Quaid e Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah had unequivocally underlined the fact that as per the Constitution, it is the civilian elected Chief Executive (Prime Minister in today's Pakistan) who is entitled to have authority of control over all institutions. Civil leadership must be respected and decisions flowing from it must be followed as basic requirement to win war against terror. It must be reflected not through words but through practice to ensure civil military harmony to create synergy for state responsibilities.
- iv. **Provision of Basic Necessities:** Basic necessities such as Education, Health and Food Security must be ensured on equity basis. It would help to win the sympathy of general public for state institutions. Otherwise they should be easy prey for the terrorist groups in mere for the daily food items. Budget for primary and secondary education must be increased on war footing basis to win the agenda of state. The provision of basic health facilities must be ensured at door steps in the backward areas. In this context, country must shift its budget allocations and expenditure to human security by provision of basic necessities.
- v. **Establishment of Civil Enforcement and Rehabilitation Corps:** In Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces, sometimes army is called to assist the civilian administration which is not an appreciable solution in the long run. Establishment of Civil Enforcement and Rehabilitation Corps in Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtoonkhan will be helpful to enforce the law and maintain social peace; and for construction and rehabilitation work. In these corps 50% recruitment must be made among the peoples of the concerned provinces. It will lessen the burden on military and would also be helpful for efficient and effective management of rehabilitation work in the terrorism hit areas.
- vi. **Police Reforms:** Policing in Pakistan should be developed on modern lines to face the

grave security threats and criminal techniques. Pakistan needs to invest more viz a viz human resource and optimum budgets. Public ridicule on media against police should also be checked so that people develop a confidence in the institution. Civil services reforms are need of hour where policing can be made independent service where Centralized policing is required to be decentralized at district level. Police authorities must be established at district and tehsil levels to provide a well defined system of public facilitation and protection. Conventional ranks, system of investigation and public dealing must be substituted with new format. Police authorities must also be equipped with modern technologies and weapon to handle the fourth generation warriors. Further more torture free investigation system should be created comprising the civil force not part of policing system. Criminals and accused after arrest be handed over to the civil force to accomplish the job of investigation. The investigation force should be among the legal and criminology educated available human resources.

- vii. **Establishment of New Border Security Force:** Border Security Forces must be established at all provinces and districts levels to check the free movement of extremists, terrorists, smugglers and illegal activists. This system should be proactive to nip the evil in the bud.
- viii. **Countering Fifth Column Forces:** Fifth Column Forces are the grave threat to the stability and security of the country. They cause more loss to the state as compare to the external forces. A comprehensive strategy must be framed to eradicate these forces.
- ix. **Curbing the external angle – US designs of greater Middle East Initiatives and ACPAK Policy:** The US ambition of imperialism through Greater Middle East initiatives and ACPAK Policy is also a major cause of asymmetric warfare in the whole region, particularly in Pakistan. US treat Pakistan and Afghanistan as a part of Middle East rather than South Asian countries. US seems to be bent upon creating anarchy in Pakistan through Afghanistan and fourth generation warriors as it will be in their favour to win the greater game of Middle East and to check the power of China. An interwoven policy especially to counter the greater Middle East Initiatives and ACPAK strategy of U.S. must be constructed through Parliament to build a consensus voice of Pakistan. US should be engaged through diplomatic channel and persuaded that terrorism anywhere is a problem not a solution.
- x. **Countering the Cold Start Strategic Doctrine:** Since the last three decades India has been trying its best to destabilize Pakistan and its new cold start strategic doctrine only manifests its evil designs. The intervention of India in Afghanistan, Balochistan the province of Pakistan and engagement of Pak Security Forces at Eastern Border are the part of this strategic doctrine. Pakistan must have to adopt winning heart strategic vision to counter the Indian cold start strategic doctrine. Through this vision, a sense of ownership must be created among the masses of Balochistan and Afghanistan must be reminded of objective helpful role of Pakistan to support three million Afghans since 1979. Cultural, people to people and parliamentary delegations must be exchanged with India and Afghanistan to reduce level of mistrust in the region. Afghanistan may be provided trade route through Waghga border with India. It will be helpful to reduce the level of escalation and number of skirmishes between Indian and Pakistani forces. Afghani people must be provided educational access in Pakistan.
- xi. **Educational Parity and Madrasah Reforms:** Poverty and disparity in education sector is the major cause of extremism and sectarianism, which are vulnerable as breeding grounds or sanctuaries for militancy. The society is producing 01 Maulana for 165 peoples per annum as against 01 Doctor for 3400 peoples per annum.¹¹ An education

¹¹ The Dawn, dated November 13, 2017

system owned by state should expand to induct students from all strata of society where education is imparted based on tolerance, democratic values and parity for all throughout the country. The state owned education system may offer boarding to poor students so that they are engaged in grooming on pluralistic lines as envisioned by the founding fathers.

- xii. **Establishment of Anti-Terrorism /Extremism Courts:** The prevailing system of Anti-Terrorism Courts has become useless and there is no hope of re-engineering. New separate jails adjacent to courts should be constructed to separate terrorists and extremists from other criminals. It would be cost effective as terrorists' trial will be help within jail premisis. Judges and staff of these courts should be trained specifically to handle these heinous crimes in a just manner to maintain the sanctity of the state.
- xiii. **Use of Artificial Intelligence and Robatic Force in Difficult Terrain:** Artificial Intelligence and Robatic Force in Difficult Terrain is needed of modern warfare to counter terrorist in difficult terrain. It would be helpful to manage the long range of Pak Afghan Border. It will reduce the life threats to security personnel in the mountain and enhance the ability of security forces to combat the 4th generation warriors.
- xiv. **Hiring the Services of Retired Military and Police Personnels:** Retired police and military personnels are already drawing regular pensions from the public exchequer even at a relatively lesser age. They are trained and their honorary services must be hired for intelligence sharing. This technique will help not only to counter the wave of terrorism but also reduce the rate of street crimes due to greater coverage in vulnerable areas.
- xv. **Appointment of Professional Negotiators and Strengthening the Role of Women in Peace Building Process:** Terrorists and asymmetric warriors often make hostage to the innocent peoples to achieve their motives. Due to this the security agencies have to take steps to rescue the hostages that result in bloodshed and killing of innocent hostages along with the terrorists. All this happened due to mismanagement and unawareness of negotiation techniques to handle the terrorists and to engage them for enough time to conduct rescue operation. Hence the appointment of professional negotiators as a part of planning to handle the terrorists while conducting operations should be made on the pattern of developed countries.
- xvi. **Agricultural and Industrial Development of Balochistan:** Economic development and welfare of the inhabitants of the Province of Balochistan is the only solution to check the external interference and to reduce the terrorist activities. More than 85% land of the Province is not utilized due to non-availability of work force. Through provincial harmony strategic dialogue the peoples of province are needed to be convinced that their brethren from other provinces are not aliens. With consensus the agriculturists and industrialist from other provinces should also be motivated to make investment in Balochistan for the development and stability of Pakistan.
- xvii. **Uniformed Religious Policy:** Through a uniformed policy all types of religious pressure groups and organization should be banned and no one would be allowed to endanger the state in the name of Islam. The security forces should stop discriminating between good and bad militants.
- xviii. **Brain Drain is better than Brain in Drain:** There is great hue and cry about the brain drain in Pakistan but there is no wrong in allowing qualified individuals who are not being accommodated by the state to be facilitated to find living and businesses abroad. It will be a productive step towards strong economy of Pakistan in shape of remittances.

- xix. Zero Tolerance to corruption:** No sphere of life is free from corruption. Corruption is the major source of funding for the terrorists and extremists. Essential legislation should be done for across the board accountability including judges, politicians and military generals through a uniform mechanism. Budgets of all institutions should be open to the Parliament and its committees for scrutiny at all times as only elected Parliament is authorized to do so.
- xx. Friendly Relationship and Integrated Intelligence Sharing with Neighboring Countries:** Last but not the least, friendly political, economic and cultural relations with the neighboring countries are necessary in transnational scenario of terrorism and guerrilla warfare. No single country in the world can combat the 4th generation warriors without regional and global cooperation. Pakistan can work with Afghanistan, China, Iran, Russia and Turkey to formulate joint counter-terrorism strategy that can start from intelligence sharing and joint operations.

5. Conclusion

Asymmetric warfare, like the term is not new in the world history. States have been facing asymmetric war techniques since the very beginning. After 9/11 Pakistan is also facing this curse in shape of terrorism and guerrilla warfare by the extremists. One and half decade has passed but no comprehensive strategic vision has been constructed to combat the fourth generation warriors. New tactics along with the conventional methods are the need of day to counter the asymmetric warriors. On the basis of aforesaid guidelines and suggestions, the engineering of countering strategic vision will be a ray of hope to eradicate the terrorists.

Human Rights Conditions in Pakistan (-continued-)

Women's and Children's Rights

- Over 5 million primary-school-age children are out of school, most of them girls. It is found girls miss school for reasons including lack of schools, costs associated with studying, child bearing, and gender discrimination.
- Violence against women and girls including rape, honor killings, acid attacks, domestic violence, and forced marriage remained a serious problem.
- At least 180 cases of domestic violence were reported in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province in 2017, including 94 women murdered by close family members.
- A report by the Movement for Solidarity and Peace in Pakistan found that at least 1,000 girls belonging to Christian and Hindu communities are forced to marry Muslim men every year. The government failed to act to stop such forced marriages.
- Child marriage remained a serious concern, with 21 percent of girls in Pakistan marrying before the age of 18, according to the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF).

Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity

- Violent attacks on transgender and intersex women in Pakistan continued in 2017.
- In August, unknown gunmen shot dead a transgender woman in Karachi.
- In a series of steps toward legally recognizing gender identity, the first bill safeguarding the rights of transgender persons was introduced in parliament in August.
- The 2017 national census included for the first time a category for Khawaja Siras, or transgender women.
- In June, the Pakistan government issued the first passport with a transgender category.

Refugees

- In July, the authorities began to register some of the estimated 1 million unregistered Afghans in Pakistan, although the purpose was not clear, leading to fears authorities might deport them.
- The uncertain residency status of Afghan refugees in Pakistan caused police harassment and threats particularly in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, which hosts the majority of the Afghan population in the country.
- According to the International Organization for Migration (IOM), 82,019 refugees and undocumented Afghans returned or were deported to Afghanistan between January and August 2017.

Death Penalty

- At least 44 people on death row were executed in 2017, of whom 37 were executed after convictions by military courts.

Key International Actors

- In June, the Committee against Torture (CAT) called on the Pakistani government to discuss the ongoing military operations against extremism and militancy.
- In July, the UN Human Rights Committee called on the Pakistani government to "review its legal provisions relating to freedom of expression in line with Article 19 of the Covenant."
- Pakistan's volatile relationship with United States, its largest development and military donor, deteriorated amid signs of mistrust. In August, US President Donald Trump accused Pakistan of failing to counter terrorist threats, and maligning Pakistan's image through allegations and propaganda.
- Pakistan and China deepened extensive economic and political ties, and work continued on the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor, a long-term project consisting of construction of roads, railways, and energy pipelines.
- In July, the European Union Foreign Affairs Council welcomed several positive measures taken by Pakistan, but also raised several concerns, including the death penalty; inadequate protection for juveniles in the criminal justice system; the discrimination faced by minorities and misuse of blasphemy laws.
- Historically tense relations between Pakistan and India showed no signs of improvement in 2017, with both countries accusing each other of facilitating unrest and militancy.



INTERACTION OF MEMBERS OF GILGIT BALTIISTAN LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY WITH HONOURABLE MS. MARRIYUM AURANGZEB, CHAIRPERSON NATIONAL TASKFORCE ON SDG'S AT SDG'S SECRETARIAT NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ON JANUARY 12, 2018



PAKISTAN INSTITUTE FOR PARLIAMENTARY SERVICES DEDICATED TO PARLIAMENTARY EXCELLENCE

Pakistan Institute for Parliamentary Services was established in Dec 2008 through an act of the Parliament to promote research, provide training and to provide facility of information to the Parliamentarians in performance of their duties and for matters connected therewith and ancillary thereto.

PIPS team endeavors to serve the Parliament through its cherished values of :

Integrity, professionalism, non-partisanship, accessibility and anticipation

For feedback feel free to contact Editor at:

Ataturk Avenue (Service Road), F-5/2, Islamabad

Email: research@pips.gov.pk

Web: www.pips.gov.pk

Disclaimer:

The author(s) of each article appearing in this Digest is/are solely responsible for the content thereof; the publication of an article shall not constitute or be deemed to constitute any representation by the Editors or Institute.